Exalted Sits the Chief: The Ancient History of Hawai‘i Island (Review)

Dave Tuggle

Follow this and additional works at: https://kahualike.manoa.hawaii.edu/rnj

Part of the History of the Pacific Islands Commons, and the Pacific Islands Languages and Societies Commons

Recommended Citation
Available at: https://kahualike.manoa.hawaii.edu/rnj/vol15/iss1/12
Easter Island studies to atone for their sins at last by letting the rest of us know what they have been doing and what they have found. We can never hope to produce a fully rounded or up-to-date picture of what happened on the island if crucial pieces of the puzzle are deliberately withheld.

Mangarevan Archaeology: Interpretations
Using New Data and 40 Year Old Excavations to Establish a Sequence from 1200 to 1900 AD
Edited by Roger C. Green and Marshall I. Weisler
University of Otago Studies in Prehistoric Anthropology
No. 19, 2000 $10

Review by Vincent H. Stefan

This volume is a significant contribution to Pacific/Polynesian archaeology, and provides a detailed discussion of the dated and integrated occupation sequence for the islands of the Mangarevan group from 1200 to 1900 AD. The Mangarevan cultural sequence was developed from excavation results of six sites investigated by Green in 1959, with additional archaeological survey data collected by Weisler from 1990-92. This volume is the first in four publications planned by the editors to discuss the archaeology of the Mangareva group and the Temoe Atoll.

The contents include: Introduction; Contact Period Settlement Patterns ca. 1840 AD; Sites Selected for Excavation; Excavation Procedures; Excavations on Kamaka; Excavations on Aukena; Excavations on Mangareva; Correlations of Excavation Sequences; The Sequence; Summary and Conclusions; Notes; References; Appendix I. The volume is 39 pages long, with black and white photographs, island/site maps, site plans/profiles, and tables.

Of interest to readers of RNJ is a discussion in “The Sequence” section that comments on the connection of Easter Island to the Mangarevan-Pitcairn interaction sphere, and how the detailed knowledge of the Mangarevan cultural sequence may provide insight into the origins of the Easter Islanders.

Though this material was deemed of a form “not fully suitable” to appear in journals devoted to reporting on current archaeology in the Pacific field, its value is immeasurable to those individuals working in Pacific/Polynesian archaeology, as well as physical anthropology. Within any given site, more than just cultural artifacts are often excavated, analyzed and collected, occasionally human remains are encountered. Knowing the provenience and cultural context of human remains is as valuable to the physical anthropologist as knowing the cultural sequence of artifacts is to the archaeologist.

This volume is an important contribution to Pacific/Polynesian/Mangarevan archaeology and serves to insure that this data is not lost and is available to all who may need it, and would be an important reference to have in one’s library.

The volume is available from the Department of Anthropology, University of Otago, P.O. Box 56, Dunedin, New Zealand. (Price US$10, includes postage)

Exalted Sits the Chief: The Ancient History of Hawai‘i Island
by Ross Cordy
Paperback, 6”x9”; 464 pages; 15 tables; 75 figures (including maps and photographs), glossary, references, and index. 19.95.

Review by Dave Tuggle

First Things First
This is a superb volume that is a necessary reference for anyone interested in the history of Polynesia in general or Hawai‘i in particular. I make this recommendation with the disclaimer that I reviewed and commented on the book while it was in manuscript form, and that I also provided a promotional blurb for the book’s back cover—but this should indicate that in the intervening year or two I have not changed my mind about the importance of this volume.

Organization
The book has four main parts: Background (with chapters on the environment, Hawaiian culture at the time of Kamehameha, and the nature of the information employed in the book); Mythic Times (with chapters on the settlement of the island and on the early era of adaptation); The Time of Epic Voyages (with a single chapter about the nature of cultural change from about AD 1000-1300); and Dynastic Times (with five chapters: “A.D. 1400s-1500s: The Ascendancy of the Pili Line in Waipi‘o and Liloa and ‘Umi’”; “A.D. 1600s: The Reigns of ‘Umi’s Descendants in Kona”; “A.D. 1700s: Keawe, Alapa‘inui and Kalani‘ōpu‘u and the Rise of Hawai‘i as a power in the Archipelago”; “Kīwala‘ō, Kamehameha, Keawemauhili, and Keōua. A.D. 1781-1792: The Decade of Strife”; and “The Search for Better Understanding”).

History of the Book
As indicated in the Preface, the first draft of the book was completed in 1991, but Cordy notes that he “continued to update it with recent material.” A review of the discussions and dates of references indicates that important archaeological reports completed through 1999 are considered, particularly those that contain radiocarbon dates. The seed of the book was a portion of the author’s 1978 dissertation, which grew into a chapter about the Big Island’s history in A Study of Prehistoric Social Change: The Development of Complex Societies in the Hawaiian Islands (1981). A section of the book is also a revised version of A Regional Synthesis of the Hāmākua District of the Island of Hawai‘i (1994). But most of the material is new, and clearly reflects the 30 years of work devoted by the author to this field.

Goals
The purpose of the book, in Cordy’s words (pp. vii and 2), “is to summarize Hawai‘i Island’s history, to introduce its rulers and chiefs, and to illustrate certain aspects of the island’s history, such as royal centers and field systems,” and “to blend oral history and archaeology to form an overview of the history
of Hawai‘i Island prior to its unification by Kamehameha in 1792.” Further, (p. vii) the book is intended for “general readers,” and is not “an extremely technical analysis of theoretical research questions, with detailed discussions of dates, food remains and tools, or hundreds of sites.”

The primary goals are certainly achieved, but whether the book will reach the “general reader” is questionable, in part because, the claim aside, there is a fair amount of technical discussion. However, these technical discussions (not only of archaeological data, but of Hawaiian oral histories) provide some of the most valuable components of the book. At the same time, the nature of the data produces a distinct exegetic watershed, the line where on one side the information is primarily archaeological, and on the other where the oral historical (Hawaiian traditions) predominates.

Most people who fall into that wide category of “general reader” will probably get little from the archaeological side, but will find much of interest in the section (technical discussions and all) where the traditions take on a critical role in telling Hawai‘i’s history. The reason is obvious. It is just much more difficult to captivate an audience with a discussion of cultural patterns (however cloaked in “history” they might be) than with a discussion of events and individuals. Cordy seemingly acknowledges this by emphasizing in chapter titles the historical framework rather than archaeological-based cultural patterns. (For example, compare the titles above with the cultural sequence in Kirch’s 1985 summary of Hawaiian archaeology.) But two things should be noted here. First, whether or not the archaeologically heavy section of the book is appreciated by all readers, it is a clear and valuable summary of the data. Second, the use of oral history does not in and of itself make a discussion either readable or important, but in the case of this book, this section is both readable and important. The successful blending of oral history and archaeology is, in my opinion, its lasting contribution.

SMALL ITEMS ABOUT THE BOOK

A few grumbles and quibbles have to be voiced. One of the aspects I consider in a book of this sort is the ease of getting at information, not simply readability. Four things in this area could have been improved: the Table of Contents does not include the chapter subheadings; the Index is adequate, but should be much more comprehensive; the chapter notes are combined in 48 pages, but the chapters are not indicated in page headers; and a somewhat larger format would have made the many maps much easier to read.

From the manuscript to the finished version, it is obvious that the pencil of a good editor has been well employed, but the book would have profited from one final edit to clean up the niggling typographical errors.

The Reference section (and thank the editorial gods, it is “References,” not the abomination “References Cited”) has a bibliographic form of interest. Over the past 20 years or so, contract archaeology in Hawai‘i has produced the great majority of archaeological reports, the so-called “gray literature.” These reports are identified as “manuscript” in the bibliographic entries of the book (although curiously Environmental Impact Statements are not). However, many of these reports are printed in large numbers, with additional printings readily available, and thus do not fit the category of MS that in the past has been reserved for typescripts. Archaeological journals have not developed a standardized style for such reports. Further, with “publishing” on CD-ROM and on web pages now becoming common, the question of bibliographic style clearly needs specific attention in the discipline.

But countering the small quibbles, there are other items that are happily pleasing. The volume is well referenced, and the citations are endnotes rather than obtrusive parenthetical text or footnotes. The term “ancient history” is thoughtfully used rather than “prehistory.” Numerous illustrations add substantially to the text, and of particular value are the maps of the island that show place names and the locations of historical events. In fact, the maps alone are worth the price of admission.

POINTS OF DISCUSSION (“BACKGROUND” AND “MYTHIC PAST”)

The Background section’s important chapter is on the culture of Hawai‘i Island at the time of Kamehameha. The summary of social organization is notable for its use of a variety of sources, including Hawaiian commentaries, observations by early European visitors, and recent critical analyses of Mahele records. It also provides a good description of resources and an excellent summary of island settlement pattern. However, the discussion of population total at the time of European contact is insufficiently addressed, given its importance in the process of history and the arguments about it, arguments that have a substantial archaeological component (Dye and Komori 1992; Stannard 1989).

The chapter on Understanding the Information of History has a well-presented discussion of the nature of oral histories, dating by genealogical generation, and 19th century historical data. This section is strong in its consideration of how these sources contribute to history, with emphasis on understanding when and why material was recorded. It is weak, however, in its analysis of other possible dimensions of these sources (such as the extent to which seemingly historical descriptions may be allegorical/metaphorical—see, for example, Masse 1995 concerning Hawaiian traditions, and general discussions in Helms 1988 and Vansina 1985) and treating the more complex issues of the relationship between oral histories and archaeology (see Finkelstein and Silberman 2001 for a case study from Biblical archaeology). However, Cordy does consider the metaphorical element in some discussions of specific traditions. But this is not really so much a criticism of this book as it is a commentary on Hawaiian archaeology, where such issues are very seldom raised, I say generously. In general, Cordy’s use of traditions is much more intensive and well-thought out than that of anyone else working in Hawaiian archaeology.

The final section in the chapter on Information concerns archaeology and I find it, curiously, the least satisfactory discussion in the book. It covers a number of disparate subjects in varying degrees of detail, with no logical organization obvious to me. It also seems that this is an appropriate place to summarize the archaeological coverage of Hawai‘i Island, but this is not presented.

The second part of the book begins with a chapter on the time and place of Hawaiian origins. It emphasizes the history
of research and debate on these subjects, including the use of Hawaiian traditions, the age of early sites, and the question of multiple voyages. However, the conclusions to these debates are far from settled and in several instances I disagree with the position Cordy has taken. For example, Cordy favors an early settlement date of at least AD 300 and perhaps earlier. Counter arguments are not made here, but can be found in Spriggs and Anderson (1993), Masse and Tuggle (1998) and Tuggle and Spriggs (in press). However, simply considering the argument in the book itself, not a single unequivocal case of an early dated site is presented (see pp. 104-109, and 122-123, and discussions end with such statements as, p. 123, “Thus, the age of [site] H1 is still uncertain.”). And on this subject of early sites, I cannot resist pointing out that the discussion in the book falls under the part entitled “Mythic Times.”

Regarding the number of voyages to Hawai‘i, Cordy favors a single settlement voyage, but the archaeological data concerning this subject are so limited that the argument is largely a deductive one. The chapter on origins also includes what seems to be a good discussion of the Marquesan connection, leaning heavily on current linguistic analyses, but uses older sources for the osteological information rather than recent work (see, for example Pietrusewsky 1997 and Pietrusewsky and Ikehara-Quebral, in press). However, despite questionable conclusions, this chapter provides an excellent summary of the history of the debates and, dating aside, a credible model of the nature of early settlement.

POINTS OF DISCUSSION (“EPIC VOYAGES” AND “DYNASTIC TIMES”)

In the third and fourth parts (about two-thirds of the text), the story of Hawai‘i’s past becomes transfixing. This occurs through creative use of the archaeological and traditional information and an enlightening critical analysis of these sources. A review of voyaging traditions is presented in the text and in invaluable tabular summaries of individual voyages, the many versions of the Pa‘ao-Pili traditions, the versions of the La‘amaiakahiki traditions, and voyaging locations. A strong argument is made against the popular model of an external origin of complex political organization and a new social order during what has been called the Voyaging Era. Here the relationship of archaeological information concerning cultural change articulates well with the traditions read metaphorically.

However, the argument against multiple voyages as historical events (versus voyages as vehicles for introducing cultural complexity) is less convincing. Another position on this subject can be found in Cachola-Abad’s 1993 review of traditional and archaeological data, a review that gives more credence to the historical character of the voyages.

In the four chapters of Dynastic Times, the detailed discussions provide a remarkable review of four hundred years of Hawaiian history—history seen as events and as social process. That review is made possible by the richness of the data in archaeology and the traditions, but it is achieved by the careful critical analysis conducted by the author. Particularly noteworthy are the discussions of royal centers, the Kona field system, and changing settlement systems, augmented as mentioned above, by excellent maps.

**PERSPECTIVE**

Kirch’s *Feathered Gods and Fishhooks* (1985) remains the standard reference for general Hawaiian archaeology (although in need of updating with the last 15 years of research), but *Exalted Sits the Chief* becomes the standard reference for the archaeology and pre-contact history of Hawai‘i Island. Research concerning Hawai‘i’s past as seen in archaeology and in traditions has seen impressive and revealing research in the last decade or so, including Dye and Komori’s (1992) use of radiocarbon data, Athens and Ward’s (e.g. 1993) coring and palynology research, Kolb’s (1991) work on *heiiau*, Masse’s expositions (e.g., 1995) of the astronomical dimension of traditions, Lee and Stasack’s (1999) analysis of petroglyphs, Cachola-Abad (1993), and new translations of Hawaiian language materials by Chun (1996), Maly (e.g. 1996), Johnson (2000), Kame‘eleihiwa (1996), and many others. What certainly will prove to be another very important contribution to this general subject is a recently completed dissertation by Carolyn Kehaunai Cachola Abad: *The Evolution of Hawaiian Socio-Political Complexity: An Analysis of Hawaiian Oral Traditions*. (December 2000, Ph. D. Dissertation, Department of Anthropology, University of Hawai‘i-Manoa). With the publication of *Exalted Sits the Chief*, an island synthesis now enters this list as a unique work. At the same time, this list of research achievements deliberately excludes any specific contract archaeology field reports as a personal statement about the quality of field archaeology in Hawai‘i today.

In some portions of this review I have probably fallen into the reviewer’s snare and discussed the book I would have written. Well, if I think about it, I know that book would not have been nearly as good as the one I have just reviewed, so I hope *The Ancient History of O‘ahu* is next on Cordy’s list.

**REFERENCES**


Trespassers on Easter Island: Explorers, Whalers, Slavers, Adventurers, Missionaries, Scientists and Tourists, from 1722 to the Present Time
Hanns Ebensten, 2001
(The Ketch and Yawl Press, Key West)
Hard cover, 157 pages, $25.00. ISBN: 0-9641735-1-4

Review by Georgia Lee

Hanns Ebensten first went to Easter Island some 70 years ago and has been back to the island annually since 1967. He conducted Lindblad’s first tour expedition when tourists were put up in tents, the flight from Chile took ten hours (Lindblad had to borrow navigators from Lufthansa for the charter flights), water was scarce, and Chilean officials were unhelpful. At that time, islanders were still confined to Hangaroa village. Foreigners could explore the island, but locals could not pass through the gate.

Over the years, Ebensten has observed the many changes that have come to Rapa Nui, and comments about these are sprinkled through his chapters. His text is, as he himself mentions, unscientific. His love for the island is palpable.

The chapters are chronological, beginning with the first explorers, then whalers and traders, the slave raids, the missionaries. By Chapter 6 he is into the removal of antiquities from the island by various expeditions. Then we hear about the annexation by Chile, and Chapter 8 concerns Katherine Routledge’s amazing time on the island. Chapters 9 and 10 pertain to colonial exploitation, and then, in Chapter 11, Ebensten tackles Métroix as “The Blinkered Scientist.”

Gathering steam, in the next chapter we read about “The Hoaxing of Mr Heyerdahl,” who is roundly dissed by the author. Chapter 13, The New Destination” describes the start of tourism, the Canadian Medical Expedition, the US Air Force, Sebastian Englert, and Bill Mulloy on Easter Island.

In Chapters 14 and 15, “The Mixed Blessing of Tourism” and “Close Encounters” we get various facets of tourism, bringing us up to date on the inherent problems of tourism, such as its corrupting effect on locals who assume visitors to be rich, gullible, and oversexed. Some of Ebensten’s personal stories of encounters between tourists and islanders are described, including problems that arise when visitors arrive looking for sexual encounters (of several persuasions) instead of statues!

The last chapter, “South Sea Sacrilege” takes on “scientific” disasters such as the moulds made for the German exhibition (these, being improperly executed, caused severe damage to the statues); the Japanese gift of a crane (aptly called “The Yellow Peril” by Ebensten) to raise statues; and the ill-advised “restoration” of Ahu Tongariki. Despite worldwide condemnation of this project, it went forward. And then there was the idiotic Hollywood movie made on the island: a real catalog of disasters. The book ends with a short Epilog and a one-page Glossary. Trespassers on Easter Island is a light read, quirky but very engaging.

The Continuum Encyclopedia of Native Art: Worldview, Symbolism & Culture in Africa, Oceania and Native North America
Hope B. Werness
(New York, London: Continuum, 2000)

Review by Norman Hurst
Cambridge, Massachusetts

What may have led author Hope Werness to encyclopedize during her sabbatical year is unclear. The dust jacket introduces her as a potter, operator of a private humane society, professor of art history at California State University, Stanislaus, and the author of a book on mirrors. Neither she nor her publisher attempt to persuade the reader of her qualifications to undertake such an ambitious project as the present work would seem to be.

Problems with text occur from the very beginning. In her