2006

The Renaca Papers: VI International Conference on Rapa Nui and the Pacific; VI Congreso Internacional Sobre Rapa Nui y el Pacifico (Review)

Dave Tuggle
International Archaeological Research Institute, Inc., Honolulu

Follow this and additional works at: https://kahualike.manoa.hawaii.edu/rnj
Part of the History of the Pacific Islands Commons, and the Pacific Islands Languages and Societies Commons

Recommended Citation
Available at: https://kahualike.manoa.hawaii.edu/rnj/vol20/iss1/14

This Book or Media Review is brought to you for free and open access by the University of Hawaiʻi Press at Kahualike. It has been accepted for inclusion in Rapa Nui Journal: Journal of the Easter Island Foundation by an authorized editor of Kahualike. For more information, please contact daniel20@hawaii.edu.
The EIF has a remarkable history of getting its conference papers published in a timely manner. This volume does not blemish the record. It is the publication of 54 papers from the title conference held at Rapa Nui, Vina del Mar, Chile in September 2004. The EIF was not only able to get the papers into print in a little more than a year, but did so with the extra effort required by including papers in two languages, English and Spanish.

There are thirteen papers in Spanish (each with an English abstract), and 41 papers in English (with Spanish abstracts). Despite the quick publication of the many and varied papers, the overall copy-editing is quite good and the publication quality is high, with a few scattered exceptions where illustration reproduction is poor. (And as always with copy-editing, the errors always show up in glaring places, such as “mundo” instead of “mundo” in the Table of Contents.) I must say that it is disappointing to see that not all conference papers made their way into the final volume, a decision made by the authors, not the editors—and this is a disservice to the EIF (considering its hospitality and organizational efforts) and to the other participants. However, the papers that are present in the volume provide a significant sample of current work in the Pacific.

The present review does not comment on or identify all of the papers, but the original list of conference papers and abstracts can be found at the website of the Easter Island Foundation (http://www.islandheritage.org/conferenceVI.html); needless to say not all of the papers found their way into the volume, but a remarkable number did so. (The book may be purchased through the EIF website or via Amazon.com.) I have commented before about the EIF conference papers that to the enormous credit of the Foundation, they are largely unedited for content, and as a result each collection, including this one, represents a remarkable range of interests and perceptions unfiltered through any prevailing academic screen. The value of this is enhanced by the fact that the authors come from some eleven countries around the world.

The papers are organized into chapters, the first of which is “Paleoenvironments and Human Impact on Pacific Islands.” Three of the six papers in this chapter refer to research on Rapa Nui, one each to Juan Fernandez Archipelago and New Zealand, and one to the Western Pacific. One of the intriguing papers in this section is by Anthony Cole and John Flenley in which, using primarily pollen data, they suggest an alternative to the common equilibrium model for the history of human settlement and vegetation change on Rapa Nui. Another model for Rapa Nui is presented in a paper by Andreas Mieth and Hans-Rudolf Bork regarding agricultural change based on soil analysis, with an emphasis on what good exposures can indicate about specific plant presence.

There are seven papers in the chapter devoted to Rapa Nui archaeology that cover a wide range of research questions and methods, from an obsidian study and field survey of stone features in agricultural fields to use of modern geophysical ground survey and satellite imagery for recording sites. Britton Shepardson’s continuing work on statue distribution shows promise for the hypothesis that they were territorial boundary markers, and in the process raises questions about statue classification and the history of boundary change.

Beyond Rapa Nui, the papers on the archaeology of Pacific islands are unfortunately few. The Hawaiian archaeology chapter contains two papers, and the rest of the Pacific is subsumed under a chapter on West Polynesia and Micronesia, with three papers. However, all of these are valuable contribution to the regional literature. A paper by Ladefoged and Graves summarizes the current interpretation of data from the long-term detailed survey of 6.5 sq. km of the Hawaii Island dry land agricultural field complex in Kohala. The second paper on Hawaii is an investigation by Thomas Wolforth concerning the nature of the archaeological evidence for battles that are mentioned in Hawaiian traditions, often with sufficient information to the area in which they took place and the details of the engagement. There are two papers on Samoa, one by Helene Martinson-Wallen, Geoffrey Clark, and Paul Wallin on excavations of the great stone structure of Pulemei, and one by Ernest Winterhoff on the extensive inter-island distribution of adzes made from the basalt of two quarries on Tutuila. The XRF-based adze study has remarkable data that indicate there was no overlap in the distribution systems. The fifth regional archaeology paper is a study by Felicia Beardsley of an area of inland Kosrae. Beardsley’s paper is a valuable consideration of oral tradition concerning the existence of a place (in this case Finol Tokosra, where the King of Lelah was said to have been killed) and the means by which that place might be identified archaeology, given the additional complication that it might be wholly legendary.

A chapter on “Conservation and Cultural Resource Management” largely completes the contributions that are primarily archaeological. (One other archaeological report is found in the chapter on “Anthropology and History,” a study of the 1868 shipwreck of the Francisco Alvarez, by Diego Carabias, Robert Veccella, and Max Guerout, but this paper also considers the social setting and cultural conditions where a wreck occurs near an inhabited area.) There are seven papers in the CRM chapter, and these generally focus on activities that are conservation and management oriented in the literal sense of those terms, rather than in the devolved sense.
that is commonly found in US archaeology (salvage archaeology to historic preservation to cultural resource management). One paper that falls within both realms is an update on the Easter Island Statue Project, by Jo Anne Van Tilburg, Cristián Arévalo Pakarati, Peter Boniface, and Alice Hom, a project dedicated to the inventory of “every monolithic stone sculpture” on Rapa Nui or that was on Rapa Nui (that is, it includes those transported to other places in the world).

There are four papers on Polynesian human skeletal biology, two are concerned with Rapa Nui variation, one focuses on Henderson crania for the biological relationship with other island populations, and the fourth (by Vincent H. Stefan) focuses on Polynesian nasal morphology as a possible indicator of climatic adaptation, but has an extensive discussion of the potential sources of Polynesian general morphology.

There are four chapters that are cultural and explicitly non-archaeological. One of these, “Anthropology and History,” contains the majority of the Spanish language articles (9), most of which are from Chilean authors, and nine of the ten papers in the chapter focus on Rapa Nui (the tenth is about Juan Fernández). These studies are generally valuable contributions to cultural research in the Pacific, emphasizing problems of cultural contact, colonial entities, and the nature of cultural identification in the modern world. The papers in the three other cultural chapters generally contribute to this broad theme. One of these chapters is “Arts in the Pacific” with two papers devoted to the Marquesas and three to Rapa Nui (including one comparison with the Chatham’s Rekohu), most concerned with recognition and changes in traditional art forms. The six-paper chapter on “Language and Culture” has one paper on Mangareva, with the others focusing on Rapa Nui, although with comparative concerns. One of these papers, by Steve Pagel, analyzes the influences of Spanish on Chamoru and Rapanui. A very welcome contribution to this collection is a paper by Serge Dunis, who summarizes his research on Rapanui and Hawaiian creation chants and the significance for understanding the distribution of the sweet potato and related cultural motifs. A general session chapter with three papers has a valuable study by Francesc Amorós i Gonnel that abstracts ethnographic and linguistic information from 19th Century Capuchin records concerning western Micronesia.

One of the often-expressed truisms of research in the Pacific is that it is a laboratory for the study of human adaptation. Well and good, but this concept is often allowed inappropriately to shift to a focus on individual islands as laboratories rather than as cases (or so-called experiments). Of course Easter Island is the most egregious example of this, particularly in popularized ecological writing. Individual cases tell us very little until they are placed within a controlled comparative context. The term “controlled” here can be understood, on one hand, to mean that the elements of change and historical succession of events are well understood for each of the cases to be compared, and on the other hand to mean that the analytical framework has been created. Unfortunately, I do not see that either of these conditions has been met in Pacific research. For Rapa Nui, for example, papers in this volume demonstrate that there is yet much to learn about its history, and it cannot yet be filed as a record of a completed experiment. In general in the Pacific some of the most critical conditions for these studies have not been met (such as the date of colonization) or the extent of long-range interaction and the abilities for two-way voyaging, which as Atholl Anderson points out (in the first paper in the volume, the Keynote Address) “is the oldest and still one of the most important issues in Polynesian prehistory.” Anderson’s paper, “Distance Looks Our Way: Remoteness and Isolation in Early East and South Polynesia,” establishes the two variables noted in the title (remoteness and isolation) as part of the analytical framework that will ultimately be necessary for realizing the Pacific’s potential to be a cultural and historical laboratory.

Archaeology of Oceania. Australia and the Pacific Islands

Ian Lilley, ed. 2006.


Review by Georgia Lee

Archaeology of Oceania, Australia and the Pacific Islands is described as a state-of-the-art introduction to archaeology of Oceania, and claims to be the first to integrate Australian studies with that of the Pacific Islands. The Introduction is by Ian Lilley and is titled, “Archaeology in Oceania: Themes and Issues” and it is followed by three sections: Part 1: Australia; Part 2: The Pacific; and Part 3: Politics.

This book addresses five themes in regard to the archaeology of Oceania: colonization, interaction, cultural diversification, environmental change, and contemporary politics. The stated goal is to introduce readers to a diversity of current approaches to archaeology in Australia and the islands of the Pacific. The first six chapters deal with Australia and comprise 1/3 of the book. It is unusual to find Australia included; the editor states this was done because it was once joined by low sea levels in the Pleistocene. The second section, another 1/3, deals with Pacific islands and contains 9 chapters. The final section, Part 3, Politics, is shorter, with 3 chapters.

As the middle section, “The Pacific,” is most likely to interest readers of RNJ, I will discuss that portion in more detail. There are nine papers: Archaeology in Melanesia: A Case Study from the Western Province of the Solomon Islands, by Richard Walter and Peter Sheppard; Envisioning Early Agriculture in the Highlands of New Guinea, by Tim Denham; Late Pleistocene Complexities in the Bismarck Archipelago, by Matthew Leavesley; Life before Lapita: New Developments in Melanesia’s Long-Term History, by Christina Pavlides; The First Millennium B.C. in Remote Oceania: An Alternative Perspective on Lapita, by Jean-Christophe Galipaud; Ethnoarchaeology in Polynesia, by Eric Conte; The Formation of Hawaiian Territories, by Thegn Ladefoged and...